

## BOOK REVIEWS SECTION

Kathy Marks (2008) *Pitcairn, Paradise Lost: Uncovering the Dark Secrets of a South Pacific Fantasy Island*, Pymble NSW, Australia, HarperCollins, paperback, 381 pp., illustrated, Aus\$32.99, ISBN: 978-0-7322-8254-7.

In 1996, an 11-year-old Australian girl living on Pitcairn Island told her family that she had been raped by Shawn Christian, the youngest son of the island's mayor. Her father reported the alleged crime to the British Foreign Office. Two detectives from Kent Police traveled to the island to investigate; they were the first British law enforcement personnel to visit Pitcairn. The officers were unimpressed by the standard of policing on the island and advised the Foreign Office that Britain needed to increase their presence on the island. In 1997 Gail Cox, of the Kent Police, was recruited to travel to the island to train the local officer. On her first visit she stayed for twelve weeks:

‘A lot of people are romanced by the place, and I fell for it. ... I saw the community through rose-coloured glasses. I thought it was this really idyllic place, and everybody was really nice’ (p. 41).

Her second visit opened her eyes. A number of girls accused a visiting New Zealander and two local men of rape. The investigation which followed — codenamed ‘Operation Unique’ — uncovered an appalling story of the “systematic abuse” (p. 57) of Pitcairn girls and women for generations. In 2000, two British detectives circled the globe to interview women who had grown up on the island. They were astounded by what they heard: ‘Every Pitcairn girl, and I mean every single one, a 100 per cent hit, had been a victim of sexual abuse to varying degrees’ (p. 55). Their investigation culminated in the charging of thirteen men with ninety-six offences dating back to the 1960s.

In late 2004, after some complex legal and logistical challenges had been met, seven of the accused men stood trial on the island before three judges. Kathy Marks, the Sydney-based Asia-Pacific correspondent for *The Independent*, was one of the six journalists accredited by Britain to cover the trials: in her words, “one of the most bizarre court cases imaginable” (p. 3). Her stories from the island were published widely in newspapers, including *The Age* (Melbourne, Australia) and the *New Zealand Herald*.

*Pitcairn: Paradise Lost* is Marks's first book and it most certainly was not well received on the island. In 1997, British journalist and travel writer Dea Birkett published an account of her four month stay on the island, *Serpent in Paradise*. The islanders have not granted a writer license to land on the island since and actively opposed the presence of the journalists in 2004. During the trials, Marks was intensely aware of the Pitcairners' deep distrust of writers and hyper-conscious that a number of them were reading her articles online. One local, Meralda Warren, shoots a “look of loathing” at Marks and fellow journalist Claire Harvey and says “Congratulations ... you two are the new Dea Birketts” (p. 123). But this is a more ethical text than *Serpent in Paradise*. From the outset, Birkett misled

islanders about the purpose of her visit; Marks is unwavering in a commitment entirely proper to her role as a journalist — to tell the true story to the best of her ability.

The first half of the book — ‘Part 1: On the Island’ — is a fascinating account of the six weeks Marks spent on Pitcairn. For readers who followed the case in the news, this section provides rich background and context for the production of the story. In the prologue, Marks pinpoints the question which seemed to drive much of the news coverage:

“Who was telling the truth, I wondered: the women describing their experiences of abuse, or those portraying the affair as a British conspiracy?” (p. 2).

The verdicts and sentences laid down at the conclusion of the trials on the island gave resounding and unambiguous support to the women’s claims, but the saga continued through additional trials and an appeals process which concluded in late 2007 in the Privy Council in London. The second half of the book — ‘Part 2: Viewing Pitcairn from a Distance’ — both traces the aftermath of the 2004 trials and looks into the island’s past to uncover a history of sexual violence well beyond the scope of the recent legal drama. After her time on Pitcairn, Marks feels that she has only “scraped the veneer” and begins a deep investigation into the island and its history: “The story had got under my skin, and I picked away at it, trying to understand the darkness that lay at its core” (227). She cites victims *and* perpetrators who believe that the abuse “probably goes right back to the *Bounty*’s time” (p. 318).

Pitcairn Island holds a unique place in stories of colonial adventure and exploration in the Pacific. It was famously settled in January 1790 by nine of the mutineers of the *Bounty* and nineteen Polynesians (six men, twelve women and a baby). Today the island is Britain’s last remaining Overseas Territory in the Pacific; the population has hovered around fifty people for decades. Almost all of the islanders are descendants of the mutineers and their Polynesian captives. The story of the mutiny on the *Bounty* has spawned an immense (and growing) corpus of popular history, literature and film. Marks’s book is a powerful reminder of the potential of places of the imagination to distort socio-geographical realities for non-islanders. In many ways, this book tells a story of the dangers of what Marks characterizes as a kind of fandom; it seems clear that the irreconcilability of the fantasy island with lived reality is one reason why outsiders who witnessed the effects of child sexual abuse did not act to protect the island’s girls, and why some of them continue to oppose the convictions. She explains that the British police working on the case use the term “Pitcairn fever” to describe the behaviour of outsiders who become so “infatuated” with the place that they “suspend their critical judgement and lose touch with conventional values” (p. 251).

After the trials, Marks feels:

“crushed by the weight of the women’s testimony ... [T]here was barely a location on the island that was not associated with some harrowing tale of sexual violence” (p. 192).

Much of *Pitcairn: Paradise Lost* is harrowing reading; it includes detailed accounts of incest and the rape of very young children. One of the victims (Marks does not use their real names) says:

“[E]verybody in the outside world thinks Pitcairn Island is a paradise. ... But it was sheer hell back home when I was growing up. Pitcairn isn’t a paradise at all. It’s hell” (p. 117).

From an island studies perspective, Marks deploys a fairly predictable lexicon of geographical determinism in her search to trace the origins of the community’s sickening level of dysfunction. Her descriptions of the island are frequently anthropomorphic: the island is “silent and aloof” (p. 10); the only settlement “crouches” (p. 13); and the longboat is an “umbilical chord” (p. 64). At the same time, she portrays Pitcairners as peculiarly geomorphic, most notably in their faces: “as hard as the basalt cliffs” (p. 170) or “as stormy as the weather outside” (p. 180). The degree to which the island becomes a sensate character which shares the qualities of its inhabitants detracts somewhat from the book’s complex narrative about the consequences of Britain’s long-distance colonial administration (or “neglect” in Marks’s terms (p. 231)), and the close to insurmountable challenges of sustaining a viable community on a “chink of rock” (p. 274) in the “middle of nowhere” (p. 7).

A former schoolteacher on the island tells Marks that the Pitcairners:

“[H]ate outsiders with a vengeance. ... It’s their rock and they don’t want anyone else on it” (p. 66).

This is clearly not the perspective of the young women who mutinied against the powerful men who have ruled life on the island for as long as anyone can remember. Marks explains that there is a phrase used on Pitcairn for deceiving outsiders about the reality of life on the island: “hypocriting the stranger” (p. 207). *Pitcairn: Paradise Lost* is an impressive piece of investigative journalism which uncovers a “dissembling tradition” (p. 208) which has “hypocrited” countless visitors and armchair travelers. She concludes her book with the words of one of the defendants in the trials:

“It’s a new era now. I’m getting on with my life” (p. 373).

The message of Marks’s book is clear and persuasive: a safe future for the daughters of Pitcairn is infinitely more important than protecting the “dark secrets of a South Pacific fantasy island” (cover).

Lisa Fletcher  
School of English, Journalism and European Languages  
University of Tasmania  
[Lisa.Fletcher@utas.edu.au](mailto:Lisa.Fletcher@utas.edu.au)

---

Catherine A. Reinhardt (2006) *Claims to Memory. Beyond Slavery and Emancipation in the French Caribbean*, New York and Oxford, Berghahn Books, Cultural Diversities and Intersections Series, Vol. 10, 202 pp, illustrated, ISBN: 1-84545-079-5.

Imagine that America's slaves, instead of occupying the same homeland as their masters, had been concentrated rather on a couple of islands thousands of miles away, off the coast of some other continent entirely. Since slavery was so geographically distant and insular, no civil war was necessary to bring it to an end. The year is 2015, 150 years after passage of the Thirteenth Amendment to the US Constitution. How is the country to celebrate the emancipation of its slaves? What are the descendants of those slaves, still living on those distant islands, to make of the official commemoration, one heralding the philanthropic actions of 19<sup>th</sup> century progressive abolitionists?

That, essentially, was France's commemorative dilemma in 1998. By 1848, French slavery was confined basically to two island-colonies in the New World, Guadeloupe and Martinique. One previous attempt to abolish it, in 1794, had been undone by Napoleon; the slaves of France's biggest Caribbean island, Haiti, liberated themselves by rebelling just a few years later. In 1848, the Second Republic did away with the "peculiar institution" entirely. So how was France, and how were French West Indians, to remember abolition, and the slavery that preceded it, 150 years later?

This is the theme of Catherine Reinhardt's engaging, well-documented, and quite readable study. Reinhardt, whose book won the Caribbean Philosophical Association's 2007 Frantz Fanon Prize for Outstanding Work in Caribbean Thought, exposes the tensions between an official commemorative mentality that lionized the humanitarian abolitionists (epitomized by Victor Schoelcher) and an island version that privileged resistance by the slaves themselves. (The latter scenario puts great stock in local uprisings that forced the presiding French governor to issue an emancipation proclamation weeks before the official decree arrived by ship from Paris.) French West Indian intellectuals today (with whom Reinhardt is in obvious sympathy) reject the paradigm of paternalistic, European do-gooders magnanimously extending *liberté* to grateful, passive, apolitical and historically unconscious slaves. Island artists and sculptors contribute to this counterhistory by producing monuments, statues and murals. (Graffiti and vandalism against objects that depict the whitewashed narrative of slavery and abolition are also part of this picture). In an appendix, Reinhardt effectively (and affectively) captures the visual dimension of competing memories of slavery with 34 photographs of commemorative creations (and some defacements) in Martinique and Guadeloupe.

As backdrop to the debate over commemorating French West Indian slavery and emancipation, Reinhardt offers four intermediate chapters that capture different realms of memory about the Enlightenment. In the first, she demonstrates how the supposedly open-minded, egalitarian, and anti-racist attitudes of the abolitionist *philosophes* were actually vexed with contradictions and flawed by ingrained cultural racism. Next comes a reconsideration of the maroon, the runaway slave rebel, whose record of resistance – deformed and suppressed by European chroniclers – constitutes the most authentic form of agency within plantation and slave society. The third realm, that of freedom, juxtaposes the

distinct views on this heady, late eighteenth century ideal among organized French abolitionists (the Society of Friends of Blacks), plantocrats and slaves, those of the slaves ultimately prevailing. Finally, the realm of assimilation focuses on the “free coloreds,” that intermediate class between (white) slave-owners and (black) slaves (in fact, a biological outcome of these two others’ adjoining), who replaced memories of oppression with reveries of Frenchification. For Reinhardt, this “selective remembrance” or “erasure of the past” by free coloreds two centuries ago transmogrified into a later version of post-emancipation assimilation that absorbed French West Indian realities of enslavement, resistance, and liberation into a noble Metropolitan French history of progressive revolution and republicanism.

Reinhardt’s perspective is self-consciously grounded within a postmodernist (and quintessentially French) paradigm of historiography. To a couple of French islands that are relatively unknown (especially to Anglophone scholars), she applies a familiar (to postmodern historians) dialectic between privileged remembering and inauthentic forgetting. What is not said or recalled is as significant as what is. Specifically, she well conveys how revisionist fixation on the moralism of abolition may obscure culpability for the slavery that preceded it. Inevitably, however, such an approach begs a reverse questioning of what the author herself may be (wilfully?) “forgetting”, omitting, or otherwise underemphasizing in the process of selecting historical memories. Three examples:

- On account of their problematic biological heritage and previous struggle for equality, Reinhardt implicitly criticizes “free coloreds” for their assimilationist identification with France and their concomitant rejection of Africa and slave ancestry. Yet she “forgets” that in mind no less than by genes, the mulattos were no less European than African. Why deprive them (by underplaying one side of their cultural and corporeal hybridity) of their free choice of cultural identification?
- In a study that honors contemporary remembrance of French West Indian rebellion and resistance to political oppression, the author curiously “forgets” to grapple with the anti-independence mindset of the vast majority of Guadeloupeans and Martinicans today. Even among those who actively work to rewrite colonial history and venerate their maroon ancestors, most wish to remain citizens of France and for their islands to remain inalienable juridical components of the French Republic. They reject today the Haitian model that, Reinhardt demonstrates, inspired rebellion before. Only obliquely does the author acknowledge that French West Indians “have to continually negotiate their relationship to France, both historically and in the present” (p. 153). The “realm of freedom” demands more consideration of islander rejection of sovereignty.
- Historians of the French West Indians may recall 1998 as the 150<sup>th</sup> anniversary of the abolition of slavery; but French West Indians themselves more readily recall this as the year that “they” (that is, France) won the World Cup in soccer. Postmodernism is supposed to pay particular attention to the *vécu*, the experience, of ordinary people, not to privilege the perspective of the élite. Yet Martinican and

Guadeloupean obsession with the 1998 *Coupe Mondiale*, which poses relevant questions about French Caribbean identity, is here “forgotten,” even though it captured popular consciousness more than the commemoration of abolition.

These few examples merely illustrate some alternative possibilities to the (de)construction of French West Indian memory: they are not real criticisms of Catherine Reinhardt’s excellent study. *Claims to Memory* is illuminating, thought-provoking, and even elegant. All students and scholars with an interest in France’s islands in the Caribbean need to read it. So should American commemorative planners for 2015, when abolition is to be remembered again. Unlike for France, however, those commemorations will take place entirely on “home land,” not on distant islands whose memories of pre-abolition oppression may be more easily ignored.

*William F. S. Miles*

*Northeastern University and Brown University*

*USA*

[b.miles@neu.edu](mailto:b.miles@neu.edu)

---

Christina Marsden Gillis (2008) *Writing on Stone: Scenes from a Maine Island Life*, Hanover NH and Rockland ME, University Press of New England in collaboration with the Island Institute, 184pp, 8 colour illustrations, hardcover, US\$24.95, ISBN: 1-978-1-58465-697-5.

Christina Marsden Gillis’ *Writing on Stone: Scenes from a Maine Island Life*, is a stunning book — engaging and evocative, riveting and moving, lyrical and imaginative. She intricately weaves fragments of narrative threads to create a deeply rich tapestry. Her text unravels skeins of history, place, memory, to render the textures and qualities of island life into a fluid, organic whole. Her book exemplifies what Jeanette Winterson describes as writing that “grows out of deep beds of contemplation where words, which are living things, can form and re-form new wholes”. Gillis creates in her book a complex overlaying of texts that represent traces of personal and autobiographical stories; the social, cultural aspects of island life; and metaphorical dimensions of islandness. She creatively and skilfully shifts her text between past/present/future revealing the temporal spatiality of islandness and ways time past and time present intersect to become time future.

As a scholarly piece, the structural form of her book is unique, demonstrating how, in Norman Denzin’s words, “Non-traditional forms disrupt traditional texts and evoke emotional responses that bring the reader/viewer closer to the work”. Gillis creates a richly lyrical memoir of place, memory and experience in a series of narratives, that re-tell collected gatherings as she revisits island stories and weaves together personal memories. Interwoven themes illuminate cycles of life, death, decay, ritual, renewal and transformation. Each of these themes is explored through an individual narrative fragment. Sometimes the fragment reappears and is further elaborated. Some fragments are singular; some are conversations, while others are brief quotes from the poetry or fiction of a former island resident. Reading through the book can be compared to watching a master weaver at

work, creating a carpet whose pattern does not reveal itself until the end, when the piece is complete and forms a single, unique tapestry. In this case, the revealed design is the complex whole of island life, the satisfying sense of fullness that sits at the heart of islandness.

Central to this story is the death of her son, Ben, “the story I want to tell, the structure I want to fabricate” (p. 7). We learn the details of his short life, his tragic death thousands of miles away, and his burial on the island, but only in fragments. It is in the final pages that we are able to assemble all of the pieces together. By then, we have shared Gillis's joy and pain, her grief and her search for hope and renewal. We have been moved beyond the immediacy of loss and the short temporality of human life and begin to see, with Gillis, universal themes she so eloquently threads amid the narrative fragments and metaphorical imagery. We have been carried with her, borne on the incoming tide, to explore, contemplate, and marvel at the layers of meaning she finds on her island.

Gillis researches historical elements of her summer home, called Gotts Island, a small island off the shores of Maine, and peels away sedimentary layers of place, memory, history, emotion and imagination. Her work disrupts a cognitively experienced, static, cartographical view of an island represented in aerial mapping, and offers the reader delicate threads of island existence seamlessly sewn as embodied, affective encounters. Gillis's work renders the corporeity of a small island as she moves in and through its circumference with what Lucy Lippard has called a “topographical intimacy”. She vividly reveals the power of island as an emotional geography: illustrating how, as Joyce Davidson and Christine Milligan argue: “place must be *felt* ... and meaningful senses of space emerge in movement between people and place”.

Access to the island is across a tidal pool to a wharf, which is possible at high tide only. The imagery of the wharf and pool act as powerful metaphors revealing entry into, and departure from, this world deeply connected to tidal movements. These images reflect the natural rhythms of island life as a series of leaving and arriving, absence and presence, home and away. Island is a place from which, and to which, all journeys lead, and Gillis refers to the dock as a “landing place” an “open-ended, space of transformation” (p. 17). She describes each journey as “stepping into my island self”, and entering into the borderland spaces between the here/now, there/here, arrival/departure (p. 15). Themes of death and renewal are entwined in continuous movements of island leaving, departing, and returning. For Gillis, island is a place to grieve; yet there is a sense of hope and renewal reflected more broadly in the island community. As she reveals: “A locus of supposed loss becomes a place of connected structures, places, people, place, history: a place of life” (p. 7). Gotts Island itself becomes caught in a net of death and disrepair as long-term residents leave, and a transitory seasonal community seeks to transform itself through restoration of the former vitality of island homes and preservation of historical artefacts.

Gillis's summer home, inhabited by the family for over forty years, becomes an anchor that situates: “It is a fixed centre, a site of memory and imagination” (p. 42). This notion echoes works of other writers like Edward Relph who envisions home as “...a place of being...an irreplaceable centre of significance”; or like Rebecca Martusewicz who refers to home as “a

pause in the nomadic process, the leavings and arrivings that make up our lives". Each summer on Gotts Island, Gillis and her husband John inhabit this house that has witnessed her two sons, Chris and Ben, transform from small young boys, to adolescents and later young men. Gaston Bachelard refers to a house as one of the "greatest powers of integration for the thoughts, memories and dreams of [human]kind". Gillis uncovers historical artefacts in her Gotts Island home previously owned by the poet/writer Ruth Moore, and recognizes the value of belongings to speak of a life past, to inform the present. She experiences a sense of permanency and impermanency in making a home; each room comes to symbolize a place of remembering, dreaming, imagining: signifying home as vessel containing, as Bachelard describes: "dwelling-places of the past that remain with us for all time".

Gotts Island becomes a site of gathering, a site for "undertaking the archaeology of memory" (p. 69). The island is embodied in collective experience: the sights, sounds, images of people, visitors, inhabitants and their dogs. Gillis weaves the human and natural fabric of the island environment and describes: "Whatever skeins come loose can be rewoven in another pattern" (pp. 68-69). She leads the reader on paths to places through movement in time, leaving traces of events, and spaces open for imaginative wanderings:

"On an island all paths lead to the sea; or to another path that borders the shore. The sea defines the land, ultimately determining the routes through which we read and chart the *terra firma*" (p. 96).

Through Gillis's tracing and re-tracing of faint paths, we come to understand that knowledge is partial, incomplete, yet we experience how such meanderings become one more layer laid upon the thousands of other layers of human and geographical history on the surface of the land.

Gillis shares the marvels of "island looming" and her perceptions of how a small island becomes a lens for "double looking" (p. 113). As Philip Conkling muses: "The smaller and more enclosed [islands] are, the larger the window on the infinite." The vastness and mystery of island unravels in her mingling of universality and particularity to reveal the immensity of island as a limitless world. In her previous writing, *'Enisling Narratives': Some Thoughts on Writing the Small Island* (2008), Gillis states: "The boundaries - on my small Maine island, the ring of bright granite on the dark field of the sea - suggest a sense of wholeness and coherence, protection and control, that counter the notion of separated, even incomplete or fragmented parts" (pp. 50-51). The island is 'enisled', separated by the sea, yet connected to the rhythms of tides and life of her small community.

Gillis reveals the physical, geographical characteristics of Gotts Island as a small island a mile across and three miles round, irregularly-shaped and encircled by bright granite: rock forged many millennia ago. For Gillis, granite has a solidity that is comforting in its timelessness. She chooses granite for her son's headstone, as have several earlier generations of islanders. The writing on stone refers, in part, to the act of inscribing a human record from a short, fleeting life, onto a permanent timeless piece of the earth. The pain of the loss of her son is eased by this act of inscription. The simple granite headstones clustered together in the cemetery that sits in the centre of the community are not only a



reminder of lives lost, but stand as a source of newness, hopefulness and discovery. Gotts Island, a place of stone remnants, is a “space of accommodation” of the past and present where Gillis finds solace and consolation (p. 2). The island exists unto itself as a microcosm of the universe, symbolizing a place of life and loss, a sign of fragility and resilience, of transience and permanency.

*Writing in Stone: Scenes from a Maine Island Life* appeals to a wide range of readers. It is an exemplary, singular book as an eloquently crafted literary memoir and as an insightful scholarly work of nissology. The author has created a compelling text that explores with insight and care, the emotional terrains of grief and loss, in a language that cuts to the core - to unearth the ephemerality of existence. Readers are encouraged to be carried in on reverberating waves of these reflective narratives, to savour the spaces this text provides for lingering, dwelling, contemplation, allowing the imagery to seep in and ripple, as it whispers universal resonances.

*Suzanne Thomas*  
Faculty of Education / Island Studies Program  
University of Prince Edward Island, Canada  
[sthomas@upei.ca](mailto:sthomas@upei.ca)

---

John Barker (ed.) (2007) *The Anthropology of Morality in Melanesia and Beyond*, Aldershot, Ashgate, 258pp, hardback, £55.00stg. ISBN: 978-0-7546-7185-5.

This book is an edited collection published as part of a series on *Anthropological and Cultural History in Asia and the Indo-Pacific*. This particular volume originates from a 2003 symposium dedicated to the work of missionary and anthropologist Kenelm Burridge, who has undertaken extensive fieldwork in Melanesia since the 1950s. Burridge developed a theoretical framework underpinning morality in Melanesia, based on his studies of the Tangu peoples of Papua New Guinea (PNG) – elements of which underpin this volume. The book is specialised and would appeal to those with interests in anthropological studies of morality or, more generally, of Melanesian society. The commentary throughout consists of ethnographic description – based on fieldwork undertaken through participant observation within a variety of rural Melanesian communities – linked to wider anthropological theories on morality. In particular, the book aims to explore the “interface between values associated with indigenous village life and the ethical orientations associated with modernity” (p. 1) in a variety of localized settings and contexts.

Following a series editors’ preface and an introductory chapter by editor John Barker, the volume is divided into four themes followed by an epilogue by Burridge. Part I: Moral Exemplars includes work by Joel Robbins and by Doug Dalton. Robbins explores the ongoing importance of the ‘big man’ as a moral leader in the Urapmin community (West Sepik Province, PNG) arguing that the close links between morality and politics in PNG have preserved this role, despite its lack of political or economic necessity. Dalton

examines the status of sorcery, which has varied historically and regionally, focusing on the evolving role of the ‘sorcerer’ in Rawa society (Madang Province, PNG), and the ongoing links between the roles of ‘sorcerer’ and ‘leader’ in rural villages.

Part II: Morality and Modernity, includes chapters by Bruce M. Knauft, John Barker, and Frederick Errington and Deborah Gewertz. Knauft compares the moral traditions (particularly the idea of moral equivalence) among the Tangu and Gebuisi people of the western province (PNG), noting their contrasting reactions to colonialism and how it impacted on the traditions and moral principles of the two groups. Barker applies Burridge’s concept of the ‘colonial triangle’ to community negotiations in the Maisin village of Uiaki in the Oro province (PNG) which took place during fieldwork undertaken in 1981. Barker observes that three ‘sides’ were present in village negotiations where the language used was to appeal to villagers as: fellow villagers, citizens, and Christians, indicating that the ‘colonial triangle’ had continued to influence village life during the postcolonial period. However, after revisiting the area in 1997 Barker notes that the rhetoric of the triangle could no longer deal with the complexities of village life. This chapter usefully illustrates the changing relations between social life, morality, and modernity, as well as the need to continue studies in the area, going beyond the theories developed by Burridge. Errington and Gewertz undertake a case study of Ramu Sugar Limited and analyse how the bringing together of peoples from a variety of social backgrounds affected concepts of ‘amity’ (the critical norm by which relationships are judged) and ‘equivalence’ (individuals are in a state of moral equality: in action, equivalence is expressed in formal exchanges of foodstuffs, between individuals and households) - the workings of which vary across localities in Melanesian society.

Part III: New Men and New Women, includes chapters by Dan Jorgensen, Roger Ivar Lohmann, and Nancy C. Lutkehaus. Jorgensen explores the emergence of *spirit meri* (female mediums of the Holy Spirit), a movement known as Rebaibal, which was widespread between 1975 (following Independence) and the late 1980s. Lohmann studies the life of Diyos, an indigenous missionary who founded a bible college at Duranmin (Sandaun Province, PNG) in relation to indigenous concepts of exchange and Christianity. Lutkehaus tells the story of Gabriella, a Papua New Guinean woman who became a Christian nun, exploring the complex relationships between gendered, racialized and religious identities, and linking the story to wider international contexts. She argues that missionary organisations that were traditionally made up of Euro or Euro-American groups have “adapted to global demographic, historical and social changes” (p. 152) and have incorporated new members from groups that were formerly excluded. Lutkehaus extends Burridge’s idea of the New Man (built on an individual’s acceptance of new forms of behaviour, beliefs and values) to introduce the concept of ‘New Woman’ to highlight the gendered aspect, but also to extend the moral and religious dimensions of the concept – arguing that Gabriella is a ‘New Woman’ who transcended the traditional role for PNG women.

Part IV: Beyond Melanesia, reflects the latter part of the book title and attempts to situate these studies within wider anthropological discourse on morality. Robert Tonkinson explores the moral and political implications of European missionary endeavours and the

effects on indigenous peoples, and is critical of Burridge's positive view of missionary work, arguing that often little effort was made by missionaries to understand the 'indigenous Other'. F.G. Bailey reflects on anthropological studies of morality, and the relationships between anthropological theory and the workings of morality in society, including the concept of 'moral idealism'.

The overarching themes of the volume include: morality as contextual and linked to group identity and interpersonal relationships; a focus on the tensions between 'individualism' and community interests in a post-colonial setting; the centrality of concepts pivotal to Melanesian society and morality, including 'equivalence' and 'amity'; and the transformation of these traditional practices in relation to Christianity and modernity. The chapter themes are closely linked, drawing as they do on theoretical underpinnings from Burridge and each reflecting on Melanesian society, making the volume well focused for an edited collection. One criticism is that, for readers unfamiliar with the theoretical terminology, it would have been useful to see more clarification of terms and concepts at the beginning of the volume. While Barker's introductory chapter clearly outlines the current status of research on morality in Melanesia, an explanation of terms such as 'equivalence' and 'amity' could have been provided at this stage – knowledge of these terms is largely assumed until defined by Errington and Gewertz (drawing from Burridge).

A general criticism of the volume is that gendered identity is ignored until the concluding section of Knauff's chapter. It may have aided understanding to incorporate a gendered perspective throughout the volume as a whole. A specific focus on gender and identities is a central element only in the excellent chapter by Lutkehaus. As may be expected from an edited collection, there is some variability of focus between chapters, with some focusing largely on localized ethnographic study (for example, Robbins and Lohmann) while others frame the local story within globalized contexts – as evident in Lutkehaus' chapter.

*The Anthropology of Morality in Melanesia and Beyond* is clearly underpinned by in-depth knowledge of the region, based on extensive fieldwork. The book is most useful for those already familiar with Burridge's work and interested in learning more about Melanesia, but is, however, slightly unapproachable to those without previous grounding in the area. Prior knowledge is assumed and the book consists of dense text, and a lack of diagrams and maps (there is one illustration providing an attractive cover, but no further diagrams). As a geographer, I would have liked to see at least one map of the general area concerned, including key locations discussed in the text. Nevertheless, the book is successful in both applying and extending key ideas from Burridge to the ever-changing postcolonial societies of Melanesia.

*Heather Winlow*  
*Department of Geography*  
*Bath Spa University, United Kingdom*  
[h.winlow@bathspa.ac.uk](mailto:h.winlow@bathspa.ac.uk)

---

Annelin Eriksen (2007) *Gender, Christianity and Change in Vanuatu: An Analysis of Social Movements in North Ambrym*. Aldershot, Hampshire, Ashgate, 216 pp., hardback, £55.00 stg. ISBN: 978-0-7546-8.

In 1979, when I first began to study anthropology as an undergraduate, Christianity tended to be regarded with scorn as the precursor, if not the arch-collaborator, with colonization and responsible for the wholesale destruction of indigenous cultures. In 1985, when I began my doctoral research in Tonga, the view held by some of my teachers was that the dominance of Christianity in Pacific island communities was largely due to a sycophantic conformity to European ideas initially motivated by a desire for the goods the first missionaries had taken with them.

A willingness to attribute agency to Pacific peoples in relation to their changes in beliefs and practices took some time to develop in anthropology post-World War II. In 1975 the Association for Social Anthropology in Oceania (ASAO) sponsored the publication of *Mission, Church and Sect in Oceania*, edited by James Boutillier, Daniel Hughes and Sharon Tiffany. This book was the outcome of a symposium which had been held earlier that year. A small number of other researchers published material on Christianity in the 1980s, particularly as it was then being experienced by communities in Papua New Guinea. By the early 1990s, the churches' role in social change began to be depicted less negatively, particularly in relation to the lives of women. Today, the increase in the studies of missionization and of Christianity has led to the creation of flourishing sub-disciplines in history, including the partisan but objective area of study with the unfortunate title of Missiology, and in Anthropology.

Annelin Eriksen's book is not only an important contribution to the ethnographic study of Christianity in Oceania but to discussions of the effects of modernity on people's lives in the islands of Vanuatu. Her discussion of the complicated socio-political scene in a village on the island of Ambrym enables us to understand the way in which aspects of the present and past are inextricably linked and also opposed. She critiques the depiction by some ethnographers of the relationship of *kastom* and Christianity, as if membership of these groupings were an either/or choice for most individuals and the membership of the first was a superior choice to that of the second. The maintenance of *kastom* by *high-ranking* men in some ni-Vanuatu communities can certainly be seen as a form of resistance to European colonial hegemony. However, Eriksen (pp. 95-6) argues that this emphasis has diminished the histories of those who chose to accept (or in her words, appropriate) the new religious concepts.

She describes the way in which Christianity spread, not solely due to the teaching of missionaries,<sup>1</sup> but also by the combined effects of ideas brought back to Ambrym by men who had worked in the Queensland sugar plantations, of women having to leave their home village on marriage, and the way in which the Presbyterian church, once established,

---

<sup>1</sup> The first Protestant missionaries to Vanuatu who lasted for any time in the 1840s were Polynesian. A small number of Presbyterian missionaries from Scotland, and then from New Zealand and Australia, began work on some of the islands of Vanuatu (then the New Hebrides) such as Malakula (from 1848), Tanna (1852), Nguna (1867) and Ambrym (1885). Several of these men and their wives remained for five decades but did not achieve notable success in gaining converts until the 1880s.

enabled women to have a new, influential role in their communities. “It was as if the church, as it steadily grew as a movement in the twentieth century, had given a name to a movement that already existed, namely the practices of women as they married and created alliances laterally instead of competing hierarchically, and at the same time had created something completely new; an organized movement which, after a while, seriously challenged the already existing *mage* [men’s graded society] institution” (p. 97).

In part the important role of women as well as men in the church can be related to the way in which Presbyterianism historically emphasized the importance of the role of the laity in local church structures and therefore the need for church members to have a good knowledge of the Bible and of church doctrine. Hence, the first missionaries usually began to learn the local language so as to translate the Bible and also set up schools as soon as possible after their arrival. Women and men were encouraged to join Bible study classes. The Presbyterian church is now the largest denomination in Vanuatu and Eriksen notes how women, as well as men from Ambrym, have been able to represent their local churches at national meetings.

Eriksen’s book is theoretically wide-ranging and challenging. Her study utilizes the theme of movement, both social and intellectual. She clearly demonstrates the non-static nature of contemporary village life on the island of Ambrym with women, upon marriage, forming relational links between villages; and with both men and women moving between the island and the capital, Port Vila, for work and perhaps to settle there. She delineates the ways in which people have initiated cultural change, such as new forms of gift exchange on marriage, as well as new forms of communality. Above all, she stresses the way in which women have come to value themselves as individuals, and as members of a socially and economically important sector of Vanuatu society.

Wendy E. Cowling

*Anthropology in the Department of Societies and Cultures*

*The University of Waikato, New Zealand*

[wendyc@waikato.ac.nz](mailto:wendyc@waikato.ac.nz)

---

Steven Roger Fischer (2005) *Island at the End of the World: The Turbulent History of Easter Island*, London, Reaktion Books, 304pp, US\$24.95; £14.95stg; ISBN: 1-86189-245-4.

and

Beverly Haun (2008) *Inventing ‘Easter Island’*. Toronto ON, University of Toronto Press. Can\$45, hardback; Can\$35, paperback, xxii+332 pp, ISBN: 978-0-8020-9888-7 (bound); ISBN: 978-0-8020-9353-0 (paperback).

The world’s most remote island is Rapanui, as the people of Easter Island call themselves, their language and their place. Off all but the most infrequent shipping lanes, the place has a score of 149 (the highest) on the island remoteness scale in the great database on islands curated by Arthur Dahl (<http://islands.unep.ch/isldir.htm>).

Rapanui's metropole since 1888 is Chile who has guarded its oceanic possession from intrusion for some time, until the local population revolted in 1966 and demanded to be Chileans, with the right to travel elsewhere and to have people from elsewhere come to see them.

The result today is nearly daily flights, especially in the high season, a large non-Rapanui resident population (mainly from Chile) of a couple of thousand with an equal number of locals and (in 2007) an estimated 45,000 tourists.

Rapanui may be remote, but it certainly is not isolated. Internet abounds, many get about with mobile phones and there are taxis everywhere to take people around, locals and tourists alike. Twenty-four hour television and radio immerses the island in Chilean images and language, to the detriment of Rapanui images and language, of course: a familiar story, oft repeated in the colonial world.

All of that means that Rapanui no longer is the study reserve for those with expeditionary forces or friends in the government to provide an annual short visit by government ship. My 1968 first visit to Rapanui was as a 10-day tourist in a converted charter DC6 B with Pullman seats fitted rather than the usual airline ones and very comfortable it was too. When I started my own fieldwork, the arrival was by scheduled Boeing 707 in 1972.

More than 30 years later there are many hundreds of books about Rapanui, including these two different ones: a history by Steven Roger Fischer and a kind of post-modern take on the image of Rapanui in popular and public culture.

Fischer will be known to researchers of Rapanui: he edited a book of contributions by various experts in the early 1990s, has a number of historical articles to his credit and claims to have done what his mentor Thomas Barthel claimed but never proved he had done: deciphered the "Kohau rongorongo" or Rapanui ideographic tablets which corpus is very small.

I am unaware that Fischer's historical work has had anything but a positive reception. I have read it and it is based on solid research. The Rongorongo translation, though, remains controversial and reviews in the professional literature have not been favourable, any more than they were for Barthel's work in the 1950s.

Fischer's book puts itself forward as a complete history of Rapanui, including events before anybody other than Rapanui had discovered the place. Fischer uses the work of others extensively as one would expect in a synthetic work of this kind. I would differ with Fischer on some interpretations, but he has as much right to his views as I do and we both argue our cases. In spite of Fischer's identification as a linguist, I find some of his "translations" of ancient names fanciful, intended to fit his narrative, and not convincing.

He bases his linguistic claims on what he calls "Old Rapanui", the language before its extensive mixture with Tahitian in the 19<sup>th</sup> century: Fischer avers, as he did in his

“translation” of the Rongorongo, that he can discover such a language, probably more philologically than linguistically, but I leave that for others to judge, which many have done already.

Fischer’s sources are mostly in English, some in German and French, but there are hardly any direct quotes from Spanish language sources, a major source for anyone interested in Rapanui, given the Chilean dominance. But there are also German works missing, including one by a namesake, Hermann Fischer, a retired school teacher who published his passionate exposé of the hard times on Rapanui originally in German, and later translated and picked up for Spanish publication in Chile in 2001. The German Fischer, as opposed to the American one under review, took a much more condemnatory line regarding Chilean colonialism that went down very well on Rapanui itself. American Fischer does not discuss German Fischer.

I suspect that, in spite of his linguistic skills, Steven Roger Fischer does not read Spanish and that leads him to the greatest failing in this book: the jumble of summaries at the end of the book from one English language source of the “latest” in the Chilean press about the island. In a work that purports to be of long-term scholarly interest, I think it is a mistake to try breathlessly to fit in the last news from the press.

Fischer would have done much better drawing out some tendencies and ideas rather than copying English translations of Spanish language Chilean press sources. Because of that, one feels that the book ends in a muddle, which is unfortunate given the orderly fashion in which the rest of it was written.

Fischer’s last word is that the division between Rapanui and non-Rapanui – notably Chilean – will disappear and that all who reside on the island will be Rapanui. This is a fond hope and one that Chileans would cherish, but an unlikely one in the near future, given current conditions and recent history.

Haun’s book about Rapanui is very different: Haun is a newcomer to the field of Rapanui, even of Pacific studies; and it shows in some holes in the argument where the author stresses too much the singularity of her island, without an awareness that there are several other places in the Pacific where similar things have happened.

Unlike Fischer’s occasional short excursions to Rapanui, Haun has spent very little time physically there. But Rapanui actually is not her topic: it is what outsiders, mainly Europeans and their descendants, make of the place.

Haun’s book is about images of Rapanui in popular culture and, she suggests, in more serious work as well. So, Haun’s knowledge of Rapanui itself may be an irrelevant criterion for judging this book: it deals in what she makes of what others have made of the place.

Like Bernard Smith well before her, Haun starts by examining the accounts of the earliest explorers of Rapanui to see the origins of the ideas of mystery and threat. Where I would

disagree with Haun's interpretation is when she does not seem to be aware that Rapanui was simply another part of the Pacific; albeit an unusual part. Expectations, visions and critical gazes, in a Foucaultian sense, on Rapanui were informed by what people thought of the rest of the Pacific: Rapanui was not an isolated case.

Anyone who studies Rapanui is delighted when they come across an image of a moai, the megalithic ancestor figures for which the place is so well known. Haun goes into this imagery in its various iconographic forms in advertising, public display of various kinds and, even, a selection of children's comics, in English, of course.

Some of the images will be well-known to Pacific researchers and others new. This part of the book might be called a "thinking person's Tikiology", to use the phrase coined by Danish popular writer and collector Sven Kirsten. There are more illustrations in Kirsten's well-produced books, but there are more thoughts in Haun's.

To distinguish between the two books written about the same island is easy. Fischer takes as his topic a comprehensive history of Rapanui and, whilst I would have framed it differently, more centred on the Rapanui themselves, it provides a good survey of the humanities and social science literature on the place.

Haun's book in some sense is not about Rapanui at all, but about what I would call a 'nissograph' (an island image): how outsiders have seen Easter Island over the years.

The books are alike in that they both are not concerned with the view of the Rapanui themselves, and that is because neither of these authors knows the people or the island itself that well.

As 21<sup>st</sup> century armchair accounts, they are both worth the price and a read.

*Grant McCall*  
*Centre for South Pacific Studies*  
*The University of New South Wales, Australia*  
[g.mccall@unsw.edu.au](mailto:g.mccall@unsw.edu.au)

---

Janet Strachan & Constance Vigilance (eds.) (2008) *Sustainable Development in Small Island Developing States*, Economic Paper Series, No. 80, London, Commonwealth Secretariat, 79pp, US\$29.00, ISBN: 978-0-85092-879-2.

This Commonwealth Secretariat Economic Series Paper is a timely contribution to the increasingly important debate on how small island developing states (SIDS) might best develop effective sustainable development strategies. The booklet draws together six contributions from highly experienced researchers and policymakers engaged in the process of developing sustainable development strategies in small island economies. The booklet emerged from discussions held at a United Nations Department for Economic and Social Affairs workshop on sustainable development strategies in Pacific island states held



in 2006. It is dedicated to the late Dr Albert Nita of the University of Papua New Guinea in recognition of both his contribution to the 2006 workshop and his influential contributions over many years to the debate.

The twin aims of the booklet are to present a preliminary report on progress to date in the development of sustainable development strategies in SIDS and to stimulate a wider debate on the issues. The common thread running through the six contributions is the progress being made towards the development of *national* sustainable development strategies (NSDS) from their initiation at the UN 'Earth Summit' in Rio de Janeiro in 1992 through until the present time. In practice, between them the six contributions encompass a review of progress to date on NSDS' in small island states, an appraisal of how effective the process has been to date, and the teasing out of lessons which have been learned as time has gone on.

The booklet has a pleasing structure for such a wide field of study. It begins and ends with general, crosscutting papers by Hirano (on progress towards NSDS) and Briguglio, Koshy, Nurse and Wong (on how climate change has been integrated into sustainable development policymaking). In between are three papers of a more specific nature, with Nita examining the experience of Papua New Guinea (PNG), while Lal focuses on marine resource management and Barrett examines energy strategy in small states.

Harito's paper is a wide-ranging one which reviews the international and regional context of the emergence of NSDS' in small island states. The paper focuses on the key issues of how sustainable development can be 'mainstreamed' into existing strategic planning, the challenges faced in ensuring wide participation by citizens and various stakeholders in the iterative process of strategy development, and the need for suitable institutional structures and good data and targets. Whilst concentrating mainly on Pacific and Caribbean examples, the paper in part also ranges more widely over other parts of the world.

Nita's paper on the development since 1994 of a NSDS within PNG is an excellent case study of the difficulties and rewards of engaging in the process. The lessons from the PNG experience echo many of those flagged up earlier by Harito. In particular, PNG has had problems in developing a *participatory* NSDS (through consultation and stakeholder engagement) and in ensuring that the process is an *iterative* one (with adequate appraisal and review procedures). Finally, Nita identifies a number of important governance and institutional capacity constraints on properly *mainstreaming* sustainable development into the existing strategic planning systems.

Lal turns from a country case study perspective to a sectoral one: the key issue (for many SIDS) of sustainable marine resource management. The paper is a comprehensive review of the situation in the Pacific region, underpinned by some excellent case studies of individual challenges (e.g. tuna fishing across the Pacific, trochus and green snail exploitation in Vanuatu and *bêche-de-mer* over-fishing in the Solomon Islands). The paper once again highlights the key importance of institutional capacity and governance structures. These are of particular importance for Pacific SIDS, given the need for a regional approach to marine resource management and the intense capacity constraints of individual SIDS (requiring simultaneously both a greater involvement of regional and international organizations and genuine local community engagement).

Barrett's paper is in similar vein to that of Lal, this time with energy sustainability being the focus rather than marine resource management. The sustainable energy challenges facing SIDS' are starkly presented in the paper, as is the issue of just how few the alternatives to hydrocarbon fossil fuels are for so many states (some 95% of primary energy supply in CARICOM states). The paper stresses that a paradigm shift will be necessary for sustainable energy strategies to develop if these are not to threaten the key wealth-generating sectors of the economy. This will need a long-term approach to be adopted and a recognition that a 'one size fits all' strategy cannot succeed.

The final paper, by Briguglio, Koshy, Nurse and Wong, brings the booklet to an end on the greatest issue of our day – climate change. The paper carefully identifies the nature of the climate change challenge for small states, before systematically examining the 'mainstreaming' of climate change into strategic development planning in all of the main global regions for SIDS countries. As with marine resources, the capacity and resource constraints mean that regional and global organizations must play an important role alongside local initiatives and planning. The paper notes a danger of an increasing emphasis on climate change: other key issues of sustainable development, such as natural resource management, human capital and social capital, might become sidelined.

Taking the six contributions together, the booklet does have a distinctively Pacific flavour to it, as would be expected from the workshop which triggered the publication. However, the contributors have succeeded in producing between them a publication of considerable interest to the wider community of SIDS. Indeed, given that small island societies are faced with both the urgent need for genuinely sustainable development and many acute challenges, the booklet has much of interest to a wider readership than just the SIDS. To an outside observer, the slow pace of crafting effective sustainable development strategies is of serious concern. The booklet is littered with the acronyms of the many conferences and initiatives which have occurred since 1994. Indeed, there have truly been masses of acronyms (MOA), and the fate of the Moa was not a happy one. We can only echo Padma Lal's heartfelt plea on page 42 of the booklet: "The time has come to focus on the 'how' aspects of operationalizing sustainable development ...".

*Harvey Armstrong*  
*Department of Geography*  
*University of Sheffield, United Kingdom*  
[H.Armstrong@sheffield.ac.uk](mailto:H.Armstrong@sheffield.ac.uk)

---

Charles Arnold (ed.) (2008) *Mediterranean Islands: A Unique and Comprehensive Guide to the Islands and Islets of the Mediterranean*, London, Mediterranean Islands, 415 pp., with maps and illustrations, €30, ISBN: 978-0-9556489-1-5.

This book is a richly illustrated and unique guide to all of the 218 Mediterranean islands that offer some form of accommodation. It is divided into six sections. The first (pp. 15-83) consists of essays on the geology of the Mediterranean, the flora and fauna of the islands, the role of the islands in history, environmental issues, tourism, sailing the Mediterranean, and owning private islands. The quality of these essays varies

considerably. Eleftheria Papadimitriou's discussion of Mediterranean geology (pp. 15-19) is dry and uninspiring, while Frédéric Médail's discussion of the islands' unique flora (pp. 27-33) is interesting and well-documented. Charles Freeman's brief (pp. 53-56) discussion of the Mediterranean islands in history manages to give a good overview, but Rod Heikell's chapter on sailing is short on useful details, such as at least a hint about the cost of chartering a sailboat, some indication of the most popular routes, or good places for beginners to think about chartering.

The second and main section of the book is a "catalog", if you will, of the readily visitable islands of the Mediterranean, with one page devoted to each (pp. 85-316). The entries are grouped by country; each entry includes a generous colour photograph of the island that is intended to convey its character; a small outline map of the island and another of its location; a one to four sentence synopsis of the island's principal characteristics, and data about the island's area, highest point, permanent population, visitor capacity, "crowdfactor", means of access, and yacht facilities. There are also ratings of each island's general tourism level, vegetation, beaches, and historical interest, and indications of a source of more information (either an internet site or telephone number), and of the best published map of the island.

The photographs are generally excellent and evocative, and do a good job of conveying the islands' visual character. The brief descriptions of the islands can be quite effective, such as that of Procida (p. 125):

Procida is enchanting, like an imaginary Italian island come true. The architecture, with houses apparently blending into each other or separated by intertwining passages in a riot of pastel colours, is like something from a film set. Beyond Marina Grande and Corricella the island is very green with many campsites near the beaches on either side of the island. An island of sailors and fishermen, Procida's simplicity is well summed up by the combination of its excellent fish, outstanding lemons and pleasant white wine.

In other cases, though, an island receives only one rather dispassionate sentence: all we learn about Crevni Otok in Croatia (p. 143) is that it has a hotel and a nudist campsite. The island has a high tourism level (four stars out of five on the book's scale) and is served by a ferry that runs every 15 minutes, so one gets the impression that the island has more of a story to tell. There is blank space on the page where that story could have been told, but alas, we do not hear it. This is too often the case.

One also wonders why the reader is told the best map of the island, but not the best guidebook or magazine article that describes the island in more detail. This brings me to another point, which is that I think that the book could have been greatly enriched by a one-page introduction to the islands of each country covered (which are Spain, France, Italy, Croatia, Greece, Turkey, Cyprus, Malta, and Tunisia), indicating some of the best books about the islands (whether guidebooks or literature, such as Lawrence Durrell's *The Greek Islands* and Dorothy Carrington's *Corsica: Portrait of a Granite Island*), and lists of such things as the best islands for snorkeling or scuba diving, or the islands with the best

scenery. And although the pages on the Greek islands contain very basic information about the ferries that serve them, surely reference to a website with the full schedules of the Greek ferry system is in order. Introductions of this nature would do much to make the book a richer resource.

At the risk of seeming greedy, another request I would make of the editor is for more integration between the different parts of the book. For example, in addition to the photos that accompany each island entry, there are some other full-page photos distributed throughout the book, and there should be references to these photos in the appropriate chapters, so that the reader has the opportunity to get a better feel for the character of the island in question. Thus the entry on Lipari (p. 115) should refer somewhere to the two-page photo of the island on pp. 120-121, the entry on Kefhalonia (p. 243) should refer to the photo on pp. 236-237, and so on. I also felt that the reader would benefit from references in the entries on the Balearics, Corsica, Sardinia, Sicily, Malta, Crete, and Cyprus to the relevant sections of Frédéric Médail's chapter on the vegetation of the Mediterranean islands mentioned above.

Following the "catalog" of islands, there is a section on all of the islets of the Mediterranean with an area greater than 0.1km<sup>2</sup> (pp. 317-360). This material is organized by country, and includes the names of the islets, their latitude and longitude, area in square kilometers, and maps. Next there is a section on statistics (pp. 361-379), what percent of the islands of the Mediterranean belong to which countries, what percent of the total island area of the Mediterranean belong to which countries, what percent of the total island population pertain to which countries, with lists of the 200 largest Mediterranean islands, the 238 most populous islands, the 50 most visited, the 214 most crowded, and so on. Finally there is an atlas (pp. 381-395) which shows the location of all of the islands that offer accommodation on satellite photographs; and an alphabetical index of all of the islands and islets (pp. 397-415).

One question that the sections on islets and statistics raised for me is the intended audience of the book. Who exactly is it who needs a list of the 238 most populous islands in the Mediterranean, or of the three islets near Kefalonia, with their precise coordinates and areas? The answer is not clear to me. Nonetheless, *Mediterranean Islands* is a valuable and unique resource, and its price of €30 is very reasonable. The audience it serves best seems to me to be those wishing to browse for a new island to visit. With its lush colour photos, the book is a ready source of island vacation fantasies, and its comprehensiveness ensures that it will offer many new discoveries. The only competitor I know is the annual July "islands issue" of *Condé Nast Traveler*, which gives somewhat more tourist information about the islands, but is not comprehensive and does not supply colour photographs of each island.

*Chet Van Duzer*  
*Los Altos Hills, California*  
USA  
[chetv@aol.com](mailto:chetv@aol.com)

---

Janet Dixon Keller & Kuautonga Takaronga (2008) *Nokonofu Kitea (We Keep On Living This Way): Myths and Music of Futuna, Vanuatu*, Belair, Australia and Honolulu HI, Crawford House & University of Hawaii Press, US\$50.00, ISBN: 978-0-8248-3113-4.

Over the last two decades, a number of scholars working in such academic fields as anthropology, ethnomusicology and indigenous studies, have advocated the development and recognition of indigenous research participants as collaborators and/or co-authors of their own ethnographies, histories and/or analyses. While some progress has been made on this front, the volume of such studies appearing in refereed journals and academic presses has been limited. There are a variety of reasons for this, including academic conservatism, pragmatic decisions about publications and the difficulties of incorporating non-academic voices and perspectives within traditional academic formats and contexts. Despite these issues, a trickle of collaborative work has begun to emerge that, at its best, combines academic analysis and rigour with subtle and detailed contextualizations and holistic overviews. Such material provides knowledge artifacts of considerable value to both academics and indigenous communities.

*Nokonofu Kitea* is a highly successful and rewarding example of collaborative scholarship. The volume addresses aspects of the *kastom* culture (simply stated, a continuum between folklore and mythology) of the south-eastern ‘outlier’ island of Futuna, in the republic of Vanuatu. The book’s authors are established (and, indeed, eminent) researchers of Futunese culture. Takaronga is a Futunese curator at the Vanuatu Kaljural Senta (Cultural Centre) in Port Vila who came to the position after many years of work as a volunteer VKS fieldworker on the island. Dixon Keller’s involvement with Futunese culture dates back to the 1970s, when she conducted linguistic fieldwork that led to the production of her 1983 volume *West Futuna-Aniwa: An Introduction to a Polynesian Outlier Language*, which is recognized as a key linguistic resource for both local Futunese and those living elsewhere in the national archipelago. Now Professor of Anthropology at the University of Illinois at Urbana-Champaign, she has continued her commitment to the island in this collaboration, the fruit of many years’ dialogue between its authors.

Despite the volume’s rather misleading subtitle, which might better have referred to the ‘Myths and *Songs* of...’ (given that musicology is only a minor element of the book’s project), the volume’s primary focus is on the interpretation of song and other narrative texts within the framework of island history, cosmology, social organization and language. This project is ambitious and ultimately successful in generating a detailed and comprehensively researched study of its topic that provides valuable insights into a culture (and here we have the familiar story) that is rapidly losing traditional concepts and community memories with the encroachments of western modernity and the steady depopulation of the island. Since national independence in 1980, a substantial number of young Futunese have departed for secondary education and/or to seek greater employment (and socialization) prospects. This has led to an imbalance whereby more Futunese currently reside off-island than on it. It is estimated that, in addition to the resident population of 450, another c750-1000 live on nearby Tanna and Anatom islands and, especially, in the area around the national capital, Port Vila, on Efate Island. One result of

this is that many contemporary Futunese musicians and artists living off-island use Futunese language rarely, and have no ‘organic’ communication with and reaffirmation of Futunese *kastom* culture.

As a researcher of Futunese music culture who visited the island in 2007 on field research, one of my most enlightening and poignant experiences involved my acquaintance with the knowledge and belief systems that existed at the generational fringe of contemporary Futunese society. Talking with the young Futunese men who facilitated and accompanied me on visits to different island communities, climbing steep paths around the island’s near vertical coast, I was struck by their simultaneous awareness of the value of *kastom* culture to core Futunese identity and, at the same time, the awareness of their own incomplete knowledge of it. In this regard, the book serves as a repository of information and indigenous interpretation for current and future generations. The book’s translation into Bislama would undoubtedly increase its usefulness in this regard but this is unlikely due to the lack of sufficient translation and publication resources.

In terms of its contents, the book is divided into 12 chapters, each accompanied by a range of pertinent visual materials (although not, unfortunately, a CD copy of the songs addressed). Early chapters provide valuable introductions to aspects of Futunese society and cultural forms. The authors then examine a series of *kastom* narratives and songs before moving to a conclusion that convincingly draws on individual textual analyses to inform a clear and well-finessed spatial-conceptual model of Futunese identity.

The book is admirable both in addressing its specific subject matter as well as for the example it provides to subsequent scholars wishing to develop deeply-informed collaborative research on island topics. Takaronga’s contribution is particularly significant. He not only contributes as a prominent ni-Vanuatu scholar but also as a representative of an independent cultural organization that is informed by national research agendas and that negotiates the collaboration of foreign scholars (such as Dixon Keller) within collaborative guidelines and with clearly identified community benefits.

*Philip Hayward*  
*Island Cultures Research Centre*  
*Macquarie University, Sydney, Australia*  
[prhsicri@gmail.com](mailto:prhsicri@gmail.com)

---

Jørgen Ole Bærenholdt & Brynhild Granås (eds.) (2008) *Mobility and Place: Enacting Northern European Peripheries*, Aldershot, Hampshire, Ashgate, hardback, 272 pp, £55.00stg, ISBN: 978-0-754671-41-1.

Northern Scandinavia, Finland and north-west Russia, Svalbard, the Faroes and Iceland – these regions and countries at the northern periphery of Europe not only lie at a great geographical distance from the European core, but also often fall outside of the collective imagination of Europe. When they do enter imaginary space, it is often as remote places, with extremes of cold and long dark winters, and where hardy locals eke out their living in

an unforgiving environment. It is easy for those of us at the European core to think of these places as marginal, traditional and backward.

The twenty-six contributors to this volume set out to dispel such myths about the North, questioning simplistic dichotomies such as core and periphery, modern and traditional, and painting a picture of these far reaches of northern Europe as places of vitality, where the increased mobility of the late 20<sup>th</sup> and early 21<sup>st</sup> Centuries allow for continued and renewed forms of place-making and where the human, economic and emotional links between the North and the rest of Europe are strong.

As the editors explain in the Preface, this book takes the form of a reader. Following an excellent introductory chapter that explores place and mobility from the theoretical perspective, the remaining eighteen chapters are divided into three parts. Part One, 'Placing Mobility', focuses on those peoples indigenous to the North, with chapters examining the meaning of place and mobility for Sami reindeer herders in Finnish Lapland; the enactment of identity amongst youth in coastal communities in Finnmark, northern Norway; the impact of increased mobility and the commuter culture on place-making and community-building on the Faroe Islands; the varying perceptions of place amongst the inhabitants of a Norwegian fishing village; and one woman's experience of walking from Oslo to the most northerly point on the Norwegian mainland.

This set of chapters expresses the complexity of place and the evolving relationship with place due to changing patterns of mobility. As Simonsen writes in Chapter 2 (p. 15), "places are never finished but always becoming", and this set of chapters makes clear that while culture, employment and mobility affect place-making, the negotiation and (re)creation of place is as old as human habitation itself.

Part 2, 'Connections and Encounters', moves away from the indigenous inhabitants of northern Europe to those who have migrated there from across the globe. An introductory chapter by Larsen and Urry explores mobility in the 21<sup>st</sup> Century and the connections people maintain with home through international travel, and the use of modern communication technologies such as mobile phones, the Internet, and satellite television. These authors argue that modern society experiences what they call "time-space compression" (p. 90), whereby people increasingly live at great distances while maintaining close ties. These themes are drawn out in chapters on young Rwandan, Eritrean and Congolese refugees living in Tromsø, northern Norway; migrant Polish labourers employed in the fishing industry in north-west Iceland; Russian women married to Norwegian men in Norway's far north; and the highly mobile and highly transitory population of Longyearbyen, Svalbard.

What this set of chapters proposes is that the northern European periphery is not a remote and isolated place, but through international migration it is firmly linked to other places across the globe. In many of these chapters the mobility of people travelling to and from the North is a vehicle to explore perceptions of and relationships with place, comparing indigenous and incomer experiences of these same northern landscapes and how, for incomers, perception of home and perception of the North are co-produced.

These themes are further explored in Part 3, 'Mobilizing Place', where the physical and imaginary (co-)production of the North takes place in a range of settings and contexts. The chapters in this section consider how place and mobility are intrinsic to one another, in the various individuals and organizations who come together to bring to life a form of heritage tourism in Iceland; in the marketing of northern Scandinavian furniture at an international trade fair in Milan; in the changing role of transportation links in Narvik, northern Norway; and in the creation of trans-border forestry programs and a national park on the Finnish-Russian border. The final three chapters of this section explore how emotional connections with place are created and/or strengthened through marketing and media. These chapters explore the creation of a public outcry in the face of dam development in a part of Iceland not previously renowned for its environmental or scenic value; place-making and the enhancement of pride of place following an international Nelson Mandela solidarity concert in Tromsø; and how Tromsø has marketed itself as modern, unique and, most importantly, 'Northern' in its bid to host the 2018 Winter Olympics.

The chapters of this volume paint a coherent picture as they consistently investigate the intersections of mobility and place and refuse to accept the boundaries of traditional dichotomies or traditional stereotypes of the North. The book presents the extreme North of Europe as a place (places) of vibrancy, where the meaning of place is continuously recreated and renegotiated and where travel, movement and global interconnections are at the heart of this ongoing metaphorical and material production of place.

Many of the contributors to this volume are themselves indigenous to northern Europe and, as such, are generally unknown to an English-speaking academic audience. These are authors whose work has, for the most part, been inaccessible outside of the North due to language barriers. One of the great strengths of this book, therefore, is that it opens up this world of northern European scholarship to a wider academic audience and provides an insight into the rich and varied social science research currently taking place in the North.

The quality of individual contributions, however, is variable. The theoretical chapters are all excellently written, providing a broad outline of the issues at hand. Many of the empirical chapters are also well-written, providing insights into the lives and experiences of the inhabitants of northern Europe. Other empirical chapters, however, left this reviewer wanting more: more analysis, discussion, and in-depth examination of the questions raised.

Overall, however, this volume is a welcome addition not only to social science scholarship on the geographical peripheries of northern Europe, but also to global scholarship on place, mobility, migration, and globalization.

*Martina Tyrrell*  
*Department of Geography*  
*University of Reading, United Kingdom*  
[m.tyrrell@reading.ac.uk](mailto:m.tyrrell@reading.ac.uk)

---



Godfrey Baldacchino & Kathleen Stuart (eds.) (2008) *Pulling Strings: Policy Insights for Prince Edward Island from other Sub-National Island Jurisdictions*, Charlottetown, Canada, Island Studies Press, 197pp, Can\$24.95, paperback. ISBN: 978-0-919013-54-4.

There are arguably two founding assumptions behind the emerging discipline of nissology, or island studies: that islands are, by definition, different from mainlands and that the comparative study of islands yields valuable insights. In the post-millennium academic dispensation, where applied – or applicable – knowledge is privileged, insights with practical application become that most valuable of commodities, a value-added product. This brings us to the latest collection of scholarly essays emanating from the University of Prince Edward Island's Canada Research Chair (CRC) in Island Studies and the larger Island Studies program there. *Pulling Strings* is an editorial collaboration between sociologist Godfrey Baldacchino, the aforementioned CRC in Island Studies, and Kathleen Stuart, a recent graduate from UPEI's Master of Arts in Island Studies program. As the sub-title asserts, its seven essays draw on a fresh comparative frame, other sub-national island jurisdictions, to provide pragmatic policy insights for Canada's only island province, Prince Edward Island.

The collection is situated within an on-going "Jurisdiction Project," and its core is a series of case studies delivered as part of a workshop/seminar exercise in 2006-2007. The book's punning title is deliberately provocative. "Pulling strings" is a knowing allusion to the backdoor recourse to personal influence that tends to lubricate the workings of small societies: "how to cajole, argue, blackmail, flirt or in any way lure the big buck from the national capital in Ottawa" (p. 11). But the stylized ball of string that adorns the book's cover (and graphically unwinds inside) urges us to follow the thread that will untangle the knot of small island challenges. As the collection's opening epigraph asserts, that thread is clearly tied to the gift of jurisdiction, Prince Edward Island's status as one of Canada's ten provinces, "with all the rights and potential that go with it." Jurisdictional power, properly exploited, gives sub-national island jurisdictions (dubbed "SNIJs") a valuable measure of agency in actively shaping their destinies and re-shaping their identities. This emphasis on agency rather than a passive acquiescence in dependency, is the thematic cord on which the seven essays of *Pulling Strings* are strung. This message of potential empowerment is also the collection's appeal to the general audience it craves within Prince Edward Island and, by extension, in other sub-national island jurisdictions. "Read this book!" urges John Eldon Green in a foreword inspired by his own long experience as a senior bureaucrat in his native province (p. 19).

Each editor also contributes to the volume. With his customary acuity, Baldacchino lays out the parameters of the study and explains its genesis. Co-editor Kathleen Stuart provides one of the most provocative essays, confronting that economic bugbear of many islands, the cost of efficiently getting to and from them. It is an issue that affects everything from tourism to waste management. Instead of simply regarding islands' physical apartness as an unfortunate liability, something to be suffered, like old age, Stuart seeks "best practice" examples of how various other island sub-national jurisdictions have "in some way exploited and capitalized upon their airspace, territorial waters, seaports and harbours to solve their transportation problems as well as enhance their global economic

competitiveness and development” (p. 109). Here, sub-national jurisdiction status may actually provide potential advantages over sovereignty by splitting the cost of linking islands to mainlands or negotiating transportation facilities in strategic locations. Using island examples drawn from the mid-Atlantic, Southeast Asia and the Baltic, Stuart demonstrates that island location can be marketed as an asset rather than a liability. Its message is the same one repeated in the collection’s other policy papers: exploit your peculiarities. Stuart’s global listing of SNIJs closes the collection, and will prove valuable, even if such snapshots tend quickly to get out of date.

The rest of the policy papers target other potential levers. Hans Connor directly confronts jurisdiction by examining the wiggle-room in Prince Edward Island’s constitutional relationship with Canada. Crystal Fall focuses on how a resourceful SNIJ can grow its population. Barbara Groome Wynne’s examination of social capital, that is, the “ability of a people to work together for common purposes and to trust each other” (p. 75), cautions that the dense weave of local networks can repel the newcomers that Fall’s suggested strategies seek to absorb. Lawrence M. Liao considers environment as a resource, surely a resonant topic when islands are widely considered the canaries in the precarious mine of our global ecology. After surveying the environmental landscape (both threats, such as the erosive tendencies of current farm practices, chemical contamination, and invasive new marine species, and current coping mechanisms), he canvasses other SNIJs for appropriate strategies that can guarantee environmental sustainability. Finally, anthropologist Jean Mitchell acts as rapporteur, binding together the collection with her reminder that policy-making is a contingent exercise in power that can “redraw boundaries and redistribute resources” (p. 168).

Mitchell’s valedictory call to reconfigure our perspective on islands and islandness is an appropriate bookend for the anthology. Although a useful compendium, the policy options identified in *Pulling Strings* tend toward the general rather than the precise, and in some cases will sound familiar to analysts and policy makers already searching for ideas. But *Pulling Strings* is not meant to be a comprehensive development plan. It is less a blueprint for action than a way of seeing. In its constituent essays, the glass is always half-full. To jaded cynics, that positivism may seem naive, yet it is a hardheaded optimism. Beyond the tentative but tantalizing proposals of its modest essays, their message to Prince Edward Island and other SNIJs is that the gift of jurisdiction is really the power of agency, the capacity to act rather than merely to endure. That power is inevitably circumscribed by a familiar set of factors, from constitutional arrangements to geography to resources, but it is power. And it is the power of agency as much as material well-being that can inject island societies with two essentials for good health: confidence and hope. *Pulling Strings* does not lead its island readers out of the Minotaur’s lair; only boldness and leadership can do that. But it does show the way.

*G. Edward MacDonald*  
*Department of History / Island Studies Program*  
*University of Prince Edward Island, Canada*  
[gemaconnald@upei.ca](mailto:gemaconnald@upei.ca)

---

Ron Crocombe (2007) *Asia in the Pacific Islands: Replacing the West*, Suva, Fiji Islands, Institute of Pacific Studies Publications, University of the South Pacific, xix+622pp, paperback, AUS\$49.00, ISBN: 978-982020388-4.

Ron Crocombe's book, based on extensive research and keen observation over many decades, grapples with the new geo-political and economic configurations occurring in the Pacific. Privileging the perspective of Pacific Islanders, he provides a broad history of Asian (and European and American) involvement in the Island Pacific, while detailing the growing influence of various Asian nations and nationals as they re-shape Pacific Islands in dramatic new ways through trade, investment and aid. The intense influx of Asian capital, goods and people in the Pacific is accompanied by unmatched and unsustainable resource extraction. Crocombe underscores the region's importance, noting that two thirds of the world's peoples live in countries bordering the Pacific, with some two thirds of international trade taking place among these states (p. 442). The book usefully challenges us to rethink a Euro-American-centric view of Pacific Islands and the world.

Crocombe argues that these recent developments signal a power shift in which Asia is replacing the West in the region. While Western Nations have been closing embassies and reducing aid and membership in regional organizations, Asian countries have been filling those gaps and amassing regional power. He suggests that the main influences are likely to be from Japan, China, Taiwan and South Korea (p. 441), while Europe and the USA are expected to decline in regional importance. Current patterns of Asian involvement and investment are shaped by history. For example, Vietnam is now important in New Caledonia and Vanuatu through the experience of indentured labourers; Indonesia is important in Papua New Guinea through its occupation of West Papua; Philippines is important in terms of settlement in places such as Palau; while Japan is now important for trade and investment. The rivalry between the People's Republic of China (PRC) and Taiwan/Republic of China has been pivotal in shaping recent developments; but PRC's "hegemonic ambitions" are bound to be definitive for the region.

The book underlines the ways in which Pacific Islanders have been subject to external strategic designs and intervention over the past 500 years when the first Europeans came on the scene. European involvement culminated in the 19<sup>th</sup> and 20<sup>th</sup> century colonial entanglements that effected profound demographic, religious, political, social and economic changes throughout the Island Pacific. While independence gave the islands international voting power and sovereignty, this has not translated into effective control. Islanders, however, do have some agency and their governments can exercise leverage through their material resources (fish, minerals, forests) and "non-material assets such as sovereignty which means that they have votes at international forums, strategic locations for international financial transactions, ship registrations, military testing, strategic denial, exoticism (which is the basis of tourism)" (p 15). The author suggests that Pacific islanders may now be facing a process of "colonization without colonies" as Asian governments, entrepreneurs, and immigrants erode the powers that island governments so recently acquired at independence. Indigenous views and interests are often manipulated and rarely privileged as the indigenous politicians are courted by Asian Governments and entrepreneurs, rendering the majority of islanders powerless.

While the author covers much ground, he concedes: “This book is mainly about the recent and continuing wave from Asia that will bring changes as radical as those wrought by Europeans over the past two hundred years” (p. 7). Crocombe is most concerned with the new patterns of Asian immigration, including: low-skill, low-cost workers in fisheries and logging such as those from China; professionals from low-income, English-speaking countries such as Philippines; entrepreneurs from various countries and finally organized crime which is flourishing amidst the speculative nature of new industries and weak policing. Small numbers of immigrants exert a large influence in the Pacific where a few hundred Chinese tradespersons dominate trade in Tonga, Marshall Islands, Solomon Islands and Vanuatu and exert significant political power (p. 93).

Given the sedimented layers of strategic interests, military infrastructure, colonial legacies of religion and language, and the constitutional linkages that currently connect Pacific Islanders to Euro-American interests, Crocombe’s point that Asia is “replacing” the West requires qualification. If the word “replace” suggests a linear and successive movement, it does not adequately capture the contemporary situation which the author so painstakingly and convincingly details. Asia may well eclipse or displace the West; but the situation is complex. For example, while US military facilities span the Micronesian North Pacific (as well as Hawai’i and American Samoa), Crocombe notes that the residents of many of the Micronesian islands that are constitutionally American “are becoming less American and more Asian each day” (p. 468). This scenario gives us some insight into the emerging pastiche of power and cultural fusion. As the author suggests, the prospect of Chinese economic ascendancy and the legacy of Cold War US military prowess in the Pacific lend a feeling of volatility to the future.

This is an important book: direct, provocative and timely. Only Crocombe with his depth of experience and passionate interest in the Pacific Islands could write this book. Like the Pacific, this is a great sprawling book: at 622 pages it is a comprehensive compendium of data and analysis. I do wish, however, that the book was of a more manageable size so that it could be more readily read and circulated. I highly recommend the book for those interested in the Pacific Islands, or in islands more generally. It is also recommended for those interested in understanding globalization and its shifting geo-political and economic parameters. The author has given us the big picture along with a plethora of details; there is an urgency to follow his leads with nuanced and theoretically informed studies. In order to effectively do so, we may need to disband some of our disciplinary boundary marking. The author urges Pacific Islanders to “get ready” to engage with the changes under way: the message could also be heeded by those of us interested in the study of islands.

*Jean Mitchell*

*Department of Sociology & Anthropology / Island Studies Program*

*University of Prince Edward Island, Canada*

[mjmitchell@upeu.ca](mailto:mjmitchell@upeu.ca)

Andrew S. Downes (ed.) (2008) *Labour Markets in Small Developing States*, London, Commonwealth Secretariat, 135pp, £20.00stg. Available in the USA from Stylus Publishing: [www.styluspub.com](http://www.styluspub.com). ISBN: 978-0-85092-871-6.

It is very refreshing to see another excellent publication tackling a subject matter that has been in the sights of the Commonwealth Secretariat (ComSec) for a good many years. With 32 of its 54 members classified as ‘small states’, many of which are also ‘small island developing states’ (SIDS), ComSec has assiduously nurtured a pedigree of studies that look at the interface of education and development. This scholarship is based on the premise that smallness of scale, compounded by insularity or remoteness, provides distinctive challenges for educational policy and practice. While each jurisdiction is unique and manifests a great political, cultural and economic diversity, such differences are also patterned. And so, small (often island) states can, sometimes to their own surprise, benefit much from sharing experiences and working together on a regional, international or institutional basis. ComSec has been a consistent, key player in this respect: ComSec-supported research into the relationship between smaller scale, isolation, and educational provision in post-colonial contexts has a long and distinguished pedigree, and can certainly be traced back to the work of Kazim Bacchus and Colin Brock in the late 1980s.

That sequence of publications, targeted specifically to and for small states - to which I also had the privilege of contributing with a co-edited book in 2002 - had a seven-point agenda: post-colonial educational provision; training policies and strategies for educators and educational administrators; professional collaboration and institutional development in post-secondary and tertiary education; the organization and management of Ministries of Education; the fostering of local and regional research, evaluation and consultancy capability; examination systems; and the adoption of information and communication technologies.

Interestingly, this Downes collection departs quite significantly from these concerns. The shift is partly an outcome of a change in focus, with stronger private sector and market driven considerations. The ultimate concern, of course, remains ‘development’; but the focal point in this book is the examination of labour market conditions and human resource development initiatives in small states. More revealingly perhaps, contemporary challenges may be different from those of even a few years ago, and thus require different priorities.

In his succinct editorial introduction, Downes identifies eight key “features” that emerge as the fairly common denominator to the large number of small states reviewed in the volume. These features are: high levels of unemployment (though not in the Indian Ocean); high levels of semi-skilled and unskilled labour (though not so much in the Caribbean); the international migration of workers; failure of education and training systems to respond to market needs; inadequate labour market information systems; weak labour market regulation; high rural to urban migration; and large informal markets, segmented from formal ones.

To analyse these features, the authors adopt a hybrid (or eclectic) combination of both neo-classical and institutional tools. This basically means that the “theoretical rigour” of the

neo-classical school are applied and integrated within the realistically idiosyncratic context of small states. Noted. What remains missing is to conceptualize small states differently.

Labour markets, more than any other markets in the world, remain stubbornly national. And so, in dealing with human resources, the default perspective is to look at such resources ‘in place’. But this is increasingly less so generally, and especially in small developing states. In some cases, 70% of the work force which has received tertiary education in small states has migrated to industrialized countries. Some of those who leave *do* come back, but may leave again, and develop into a pattern of brain rotation or brain circulation. Ultimately, one must recognize that ultra-national mobility is part of the survival algorithm of small and island state citizens. Which begs the question: how to balance the rights and interests of the mobile with the need to prevent the erosion of the development process of small countries? Perhaps we are conceiving of the wrong form of development?

The book features four, tightly written chapters that address the burgeoning questions outlined in the introduction within the context of the three regions with the largest concentration of small states: Mahendra Reddy writes about the Pacific; Andrew Downes (again) writes about the Caribbean; and Happy Siphambe considers Southern Africa and the Indian Ocean. The majority of the cases reviewed are island states and territories. Roli Degazon-Johnson takes a more focussed look at the migration of teachers and nurses from the small Commonwealth states.

One feature of the brain and skill drain (or rotation/circulation) that the authors do not consider is the demographic safety valve that migration affords to small jurisdictions (see p. 44). An expanding population means that an economy that is growing at the same rate would only maintain, and not improve, current levels of development. Sub-national island jurisdictions like Niue, the Cooks and, to a lesser extent, Tokelau – which, while not sovereign states, are nevertheless included in Reddy’s chapter – enjoy considerable self-determination, but remain incorporated within a larger and richer state (New Zealand). This arrangement has many benefits, but the ability of these islanders to operate fully in the New Zealand labour market is certainly one of the most prized.

On a different tack, I find it rather ironic that the editor in particular makes a clarion call for three initiatives: the introduction of a “national production plan” (p. 6), of labour market information systems and of social partnership arrangements in small states, the latter based on the success of the Barbados model (and where the editor is based). In the smallest jurisdictions, the networking and social webbing of workers, employers and government officials makes such ‘social partnership’ a daily reality; labour market information is well known, though possibly not documented in such a way that makes it just as well known or accessible to outsiders. And planning at the national level is fraught with difficulty, given that the small economy is so open, elastic (some would say vulnerable) and hypothermic. Meanwhile, Barbados has embraced the ethos of labour relations (including the elusive protestant work ethic?) as practised in various developed countries; and this matches the country’s overall respect for the formalism and institutionalization inherited from the colonial experience.

Finally, *Labour Markets in Small Developing States* does well to grapple with a perennial difficulty of the educational systems of small states and territories: their ability to function as effective passport or visa providers for the well educated, without necessarily meeting the needs of the local economy and society. Developing well-paying and challenging jobs in prestigious economic sub-sectors - and so developing the human resources that would be required to take up those jobs - is a challenge in locations where there is hardly any private sector (other than the informal economy) and where exports depend considerably on one or a few unprocessed natural products – sugar, banana, bauxite, coffee, copra, phosphate – which may not require particularly sophisticated skills to mine or harvest. In such situations, it is not beneficial that at least some of the population is afforded the means to leave? Some of these emigrants would come back, as they do, when and if the right employment or business situations present themselves in their home jurisdiction. Creating such enticing prospects for return is one major challenge for small states. No surprise, therefore, that the more successful small states have managed, not so much to hold on to, but to lure back their brightest and ablest; they have developed private sectors that include small scale manufacturing, branded tourism experiences, banking and finance industries and similar niche sectors with attractive conditions of employment in order to do so.

Godfrey Baldacchino  
Island Studies Program  
University of Prince Edward Island, Canada  
[gbaldacchino@upei.ca](mailto:gbaldacchino@upei.ca)

---

Bartolomeo dalli Sonetti, *Isolario*, Valencia, Spain, Vicent García, 2006, hardcover, 80pp, €560, ISBN: 8487988849.

Bartolomeo dalli Sonetti's *Isolario* is a late 15<sup>th</sup> century island book that covers the Greek Archipelago, describing each island with a sonnet (hence the author's name), and illustrating each with a map. It is the second surviving illustrated island book, after Christofò Buondelmonti's *Liber insularum archipelagi* [*Book of the Islands in the Archipelago*] composed around 1420, from which Sonetti borrows liberally. Sonetti describes many islands with just 17 lines of poetry; islands with richer histories are accorded a few more lines, or a whole extra sonnet, while a total of eight sonnets are devoted to Crete.

Sonetti's work exists in three manuscripts, namely Brussels, Bibliothèque Royale, Cartes et Plans, 17874 (7379); Greenwich, National Maritime Museum, P/21; and Venice, Biblioteca Marciana, It. IX.188 (6286) - see below on the alleged Paris manuscript; and two printed editions, published in Venice, c. 1485 and 1532. The maps in the Venice edition of c. 1485 are the first nautical charts to appear in print, and thus this edition is of considerable historical significance.

The book under review here is a facsimile of the copy of the c. 1485 edition in Madrid, Biblioteca Nacional de España, INC/1261. A facsimile of a different copy of this edition

was published in the early 1970s with an introduction by Frederick R. Goff (Bartolommeo dalli Sonetti, *Isolario*, Amsterdam: Theatrum Orbis Terrarum Ltd., 1972), and so the question arises as to whether a new facsimile is necessary. The 1972 facsimile edition is difficult to obtain; more importantly, the copy of Sonetti's *Isolario* in the Biblioteca Nacional is special: its maps are richly hand-painted, with added toponyms, making the maps more visually stimulating and informative, and giving the book much of the character of a manuscript.

Sonetti's unadorned printed maps, which are spare and schematic, may be conveniently consulted in the digitized copy of the Universidad de Sevilla (see <http://fondosdigitales.us.es> – this copy includes hand-written Spanish translations of each sonnet), as well as in the 1972 facsimile edition. Most of the islands are elegantly framed in a large compass rose which indicates the orientation of the map, and there are occasional depictions of buildings, towns, mountains, and rivers on the islands. The lack of toponyms on any of the maps evidently invited annotation, just as their simplicity invited artistic elaboration. The maps in the copy of the book in Milan, Biblioteca Estense, Alfa E.5.15, have not only hand-written toponyms but also historical and geographical notes related to the islands depicted, all in the hand of Giovanni Bembo. And there are several hand-painted copies of the c. 1485 edition in addition to the Madrid copy, including one in Paris which is mistakenly catalogued and described in the literature as a manuscript (Bibliothèque nationale de France, Cartes et Plans, Ge DD 1989), two at the Morgan Library in New York (Incunabula Collection ChL951 and ChL951a), and one at the University of Illinois (Incunabula 852 B2850i1485).

The toponyms in the hand-annotated copies of the book, including those in the facsimile edition reviewed here, would make a worthwhile subject for investigation, for there are often more toponyms handwritten on the maps than there are in Sonetti's accompanying text. Thus the artist was clearly using a supplementary source of information, and it would be very interesting to know what source that was.

In the Madrid exemplar, the coasts of the islands are painted green, the interiors yellow, and the buildings red. The water immediately adjacent to the coasts is painted a dark blue, which is surrounded by a lighter blue band, and the water further from the islands is left uncolored. This coloring scheme is attractive, and differs from the scheme in the Brussels manuscript of the work, where the islands are a more uniform greenish-yellow and the water uncolored, and in the Greenwich manuscript, where the islands are dark green and the water uncolored (images of the maps in this manuscript may be consulted on the internet site of the National Maritime Museum, at <http://www.nmm.ac.uk>). The hand-coloring in the above-mentioned copy of the book in the Bibliothèque nationale de France is particularly elegant.

I have spoken at some length of Sonetti's maps, but it is also important to give an idea of his text, which is in the Venetian dialect, and of which no translation into a more widely read language has been published. Here is an English translation of the first of Sonetti's two sonnets on Rhodes, with thanks to my colleague Prof. Giuseppe Ragone:



St. Paul wrote to this city [i.e. Colossi on Rhodes] and to its inhabitants, named “Colossians,” [exhorting them] not to mind their earthly things, but rather to love things heavenly, holy and divine. In this island there are beautiful summer roses, that with their noble perfume comfort the senses; because of these (i.e. the roses) this name is attributed to the island: in fact “Rhodes” is derived from the Greek word for “roses”. Its ancient city was once the seat of many nobles of Asia Minor, now called Turkey, and now is decaying: for it was the noblest and the greatest [of all the cities], but earthquakes, I tell you, have in part destroyed her proud towers. And know, reader, that the island is more delightful than any other, and has a perimeter of 154 miles, and once – in ancient times – was named Onbire, Dria, Arabiria and Gialiso, for your information.

In fact, St. Paul wrote his *Epistle to the Colossians* to the Colossians in Asia Minor, and not to the inhabitants of Rhodes. The text is a brief florilegium of details about the island, rather than a systematic account of the island’s features or history. Sonetti was evidently of quite a poetic bent; we might have expected more in the way of practical nautical information from a man who had visited the Greek islands fifteen times first as an officer, and then as the captain of a ship, as the author tells us he has done.

The Vicent García facsimile edition of the Madrid copy of Sonetti is very finely produced. It is printed on special high-quality paper, is bound between wooden boards covered in parchment, and comes in a slip-case. The quality of the printing is excellent. The price of the book, 560 euros, puts it out of the reach of all except university libraries and ardent collectors, but I do hope that libraries will purchase the book. It is a thing of beauty, and shows Sonetti’s ground-breaking work as it was no doubt intended to be seen, that is, with its maps graced with toponyms and wonderfully hand-painted.

In approximately three years, Vicent García plans to publish a commentary on the facsimile; rather than producing the commentary as a separate book, it will appear as part of volume 12 of their series *Bibliofilia Antigua*, which volume will contain commentaries on other facsimiles as well. Unfortunately, this book is not included in the price of the facsimile; the volumes of *Bibliofilia Antigua* which are currently for sale cost 141 euros.

Chet Van Duzer  
Los Altos Hills, California  
USA  
[chetv@aol.com](mailto:chetv@aol.com)

---

Nancy Priscilla Naro, Roger Sansi-Roca and David H. Treece (eds.) (2007) *Cultures of the Lusophone Black Atlantic* (Studies of the Americas). Basingstoke, Palgrave Macmillan, hardback, 272pp, US\$79.95, ISBN: 978-0-230-60047-8.

In offering the reader a collection of historical and anthropological essays divided into three sections – “Colonial Formations”, “Migration and Colonial Cultures”, and

“Hybridity, Multiculturalism, and Racial Politics” – *Cultures of the Lusophone Black Atlantic* is largely successful in its stated aim:

‘[D]iscuss[ing] the advantages, possibilities, and even the limitations of proposing the Lusophone Black Atlantic as a space of historical and cultural production’ (p.8).

However, and unsurprisingly, no final resolution is arrived at within its covers. In an introductory essay entitled “The Atlantic, between Scylla and Charybdis”, the volume’s editors chart the waters that its contributors will (re)explore, and make clear their hope that the intellectual bounty made available as a result will enrich the intellectual wealth of Anglophone or “cosmopolitan” scholars who rarely go beyond merely dipping their toes in Lusophone currents (p.12).

With due acknowledgment to Paul Gilroy’s “seminal work” (p.4), *The Black Atlantic* (1993), *Cultures of the Lusophone Black Atlantic* brings into critical focus the diversity of cultural interactions that took place during Portugal’s prolonged colonial experience, and in which the Atlantic Ocean acted (or was made to act) as the means of access to the lands and peoples surrounding it. However, in doing so, this volume’s essays manage to attenuate what its editors see as epistemological shortcomings not only in Gilroy’s *The Black Atlantic*, but also in Linebaugh and Rediker’s earlier *The Multi-Headed Hydra* (1990), since both works ‘at some points fall into the trap of identity and “difference”, which in many ways limits the productive potential of the seas as a master trope’ (p.5). The comings and goings of peoples, goods, cultures and ideas over the Lusophone Black Atlantic, as they are represented in this collection of essays, undermine manichean binaries such as Black versus White Atlantic, or Proletarian versus Capitalist Atlantic, in which the first elements ‘always resist, sometimes heroically, but never really take the lead’ (p.5).

The opening essay in the volume’s first section, which consists of three chapters, represents a prime example of how specific historical contexts problematize simplistic generalizations of the agency of colonizers. In “The Fetish in the Lusophone Atlantic”, Roger Sansi-Roca illustrates convincingly how the Portuguese terms *feitiço* (magic charm) and *feitçaria* (sorcery) are exported to Western Africa during Portugal’s overseas expansion to be applied to instances of what they deem to be African witchcraft, only to be subsequently transformed into the term “fetish” by Northern Europeans, such as the English and Dutch, and identified as a purely African phenomenon, with no reference to its Portuguese origins. With this transformation, not only does fetishism send Africans ‘far back in history to the dark origins of humanity at an impossible distance from enlightened Europe’ (p.19); but it also marks out the creolized communities that appeared in Portuguese territories as deviant and, ultimately, is used by Protestant Europeans to call into question Portugal’s own validity as a colonizing nation since Catholicism is seen as only one step removed from fetishism.

Philip J. Havik’s chapter offers a detailed account of the changing fortunes of the Kriston coastal communities of Portuguese Guinea who, as Christianized Africans, played a central role in the trading networks between the African interior and the archipelago of Cape

Verde, developing their own Creole language – Kriol – which is now ‘the *de facto* national language of independent Guinea Bissau’ (p.64), having resisted belated attempts by the Portuguese in the twentieth century to modernize their colonial enterprise using Cape Verdeans as their “civilizing” agents. The volume’s initial section is concluded with Luiz Mott’s essay on the “Historical Roots of Homosexuality in the Lusophone Atlantic”; supporting his argument with documentary evidence, Mott points to the existence of pre-colonial homosexuality in Africa and to the slave trade as a means of exporting socialised forms of African homosexuality such as the Angolan *quimbanda* to the Portuguese metropole and Brazil, as well as to the Portuguese Inquisition’s practice of exiling Portuguese sodomites to Portugal’s overseas possessions, including those in Africa itself.

The volume’s central section is also its largest, containing five essays – “Atlantic Microhistories” (Roquinaldo Ferreira), “Colonial Aspirations” (Nancy Naro), “Agudás from Benin” (Milton Guran), “Emigration and the Spatial Production of Difference from Cape Verde” (Kesha Fikes), and “African and Brazilian Altars in Lisbon” (Clara Saraiva) – in which its authors examine discrete communities who may be overlooked in most narratives of the Portuguese Atlantic empire. All of them underline implicitly the need to temper general theories of the colonial or postcolonial by highlighting specific historical contexts that bring into focus a multi-directional cultural traffic and relations of power. Ferreira’s opening chapter on the slave trade between Angola and Brazil in the eighteenth and early nineteenth centuries, for example, shifts attention away from the North Atlantic, and disrupts persistent representations of a triangular trade, with Portugal forming its dominant apex. Instead, merchants born in Angola create intimate social and family ties with counterparts in Brazil, whilst Rio is shown as the source of financial backing for the slave trade. The section’s concluding chapter returns Portugal to centre-stage, but only for Saraiva to show how African and Brazilian migration to Portugal from the 1960s onwards has brought with it transnational religions that bridge ‘the three points of the “Portuguese Atlantic”’ (p.177).

The final section in *Cultures of the Lusophone Black Atlantic* focuses on recent moves in black Lusophone cultural discourses towards more nationalist and essentialist notions of “Africanity”, and away from notions of hybridity, miscegenation and syncretism. Its three chapters analyse the development of Bahian capoeira lyrics and their role in the transmission of cultural memory and the struggle for emancipation (Matthias Assunção), the divergent portrayal of a collective African memory through the practice of the *Orisha* religion in Brazil and Africa (Stefania Capone), and how the ideals of a miscegenated and culturally hybrid Brazil are giving way to those that see it as a multiethnic and multicultural society (Peter Fry).

Ultimately, *Cultures of the Lusophone Black Atlantic* represents an invaluable insight into the cultural diversity of the Lusophone Atlantic space, and it is hoped that the detailed case-studies this volume contains will further a process initiated by those such as Miguel Vale de Almeida, Boaventura de Sousa Santos or Paulo de Medeiros (of whom only the first – an anthropologist – is cited by any of the contributors) who have repeatedly called into question theories of the colonial and postcolonial principally based on the study of the British Empire. This is in no way to suggest that the study of Portuguese colonialism

*Book Reviews Section*

should seek to oppose “Anglophone” theories of the colonial and postcolonial, but rather that scholars working in these fields can only gain from swimming in each other’s intellectual waters, as the editors themselves clearly suggest (p.12). However, as they make fairly explicit, perhaps those who work outside the Anglophone sphere are nevertheless fairly familiar with it, whereas the same cannot generally be said of those working within it. So, let *Cultures of the Lusophone Black Atlantic* stand as an invitation to do something more than just direct ‘the scholarly gaze of the cosmopolitan to the Lusophone Black Atlantic’ (p.12), but to critically engage with it. Come on in, the water’s fine!

*Anthony Soares*  
*School of Languages, Literatures and Performing Arts*  
*Queen’s University Belfast*  
*Northern Ireland, U.K.*  
[a.soares@qub.ac.uk](mailto:a.soares@qub.ac.uk)

